STANFORD UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
13
1930

AN EVALUATION

OF THE

KEYSTONE SERIES

OF

RELIGIOUS EDUCATION TEXTS

A DISSERTATION

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
OF NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

BY

Roy Leo VanDeman

L. C.

STANFORD UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES
LIBRARY

3781
N87V

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT

OF THE

REQUIREMENTS

OF

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

FOR THE

DEGREE

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

1925

An Abstract

AN EVALUATION

OF THE

KEYSTONE SERIES

OF

RELIGIOUS EDUCATION TEXTS

BY

Roy Leo VanDeman

Filed with the Dean May 3, 1924

COPYRIGHT 1926 BY
R. L. VAN DEMAN

CONTENTS

Page

Chapter I. Principles 1

Definitions (1). Application of educational principles to religious training (1). Implications involved in the primacy of the child (2). Social training an essential in religious education (3). The test of immediate applicability (4).

Chapter II. Score Card 6

Mechanical criteria (7). Literary values (7). Content judged by its fitness to meet the needs of the individual child, the general demands of society and the particular requirements of the church (7-11). Pedagogical provisions to aid the learner (11). Teaching helps judged in the organization of a text as a whole and in the individual lessons (11-12).

Chapter III. Detailed Evaluations of the Keystone Texts 13

Consideration of the Keystone objectives (13). Evaluation of the materials for beginners, ages four and five (13-17). The primary lessons considered (17-23). The junior series described (23-28). Texts for the years of adolescence evaluated (28-34). A summary of the percentages reached (35).

Chapter IV. Conclusions and Recommendations 36

The need of new graded objectives (36). Characteristics of the future religious curriculum (36). Suggestions regarding home correlation, worship materials, missionary education, correlation with public school subjects, correlation with play life, problem books, binding, illustrations and decoration (36-40).

Bibliography 41

CHAPTER I

PRINCIPLES

The purpose here is to state the criteria by which to judge a curriculum of religious education and upon these criteria to evaluate a single series of religious education texts. "The Keystone Series", for ages four to seventeen, inclusive, is based upon the International Graded Lessons and prepared for Sunday schools by the American Baptist Publication Society at Philadelphia, representing the Northern Baptist Convention, W. Edward Raffety, Ph. D., Editor in Chief. These twelve-month units were issued in present editions at various dates from 1909 to 1921.

By religious education is meant that educative process by which children and youth are progressively led to participate in the experiences, spirit and practice of the Christian religion. Among its experiences are the fellowship of Christian teachers, growing acquaintance with the history and meaning of the religion which centers in Jesus, increasing response to the beauty and leadership of the faith which Jesus had, and progressive participation in the service of religion to the world. By the spirit of Christ is meant whatever one comes to have within himself through the progressive assimilation of the ideals and life of the master. By the practice of the Christian religion is meant its expression in life, conduct and attitude.

The criteria by which to judge a religious education curriculum must be stated, as in the case of any curriculum, in view of the principles of education, the primacy of the child, the demands of the social whole of which the child is a part and the applicability of the materials to the individual and general situations to be met. Principles of curriculum making approvable both by sound education and by sound religion, are to be acknowledged in religious education. What is involved in these?

1. *The principles of education apply in religious development as in other phases of development.*

This generalization may be accepted without argument if religious development, as here assumed, consists in the increase of one's appreciation of religious truth, the socializing of one's attitudes, and the cumulative habituation of one's activities so as to express religious conviction and emotion in terms of enlarging usefulness among fellows and free obedience toward God. Religion may and ought to rejoice in

all the advance made in educational theory and practice. There is more in common than in contrast between education and religion. Religion finds in education a co-laborer of like spirit and aim. What data educational psychology is discovering about children may be taken advantage of in religious training. Whatever of method or of organization has been proved valuable in general education can be utilized in religious education. Such a document as the Iowa Plan of Character Education may become a Christian treatise by substituting the term religious for the term moral. The outstanding discovery made by education, the discovery of the child, throws all its light on the problems of Christian nurture. Children must use the same capacities, feel the same limitations, proceed by the same mental processes and store their gains in the same graneries of habit in their religious growth which they use in other aspects of their development. There is a necessary sense in which one's religion is achieved just as an education is. The same unified personality is at work upon the problem. The same child is at growth. Objectives involving the learning, the attitudes and the activities of the same person are involved. The same educational principles apply.

2. *The primacy of the child.*

It is an axiom in modern education that the individual children are the first consideration. We ask what are their interests, their present development, their capacities at a given age. We inquire what genetic psychology can show about the normal outgoings of life. Similarly, in religious development, we ask what qualities, attitudes, understandings and skills progressively represent the normal religious maturation of children. Considering the infinite series of possibilities lying before each child, which of these represent his best available religious attainment? In accordance with the best that is in him what ought we to help him to become? What does original nature dictate? If a child has a religious nature, a capacity for religious response of emotion, ideation and activity what development does this religious nature ask for at the hands of intelligent Christian teaching?

This principle involves us in the necessity of leading children into the practice of the religious life and not merely into the learning of religious facts and truth. General education has made plain that, in teaching and in learning, if we would help one to learn we must help nim to gain one experience after another, as many of them as possible original and as few of them as possible vicarious. One learns only by entering into experience. Accordingly our religious curriculum contemplates more than mere provision of information drawn from the deposit of Christian teaching within and without the Bible. We agree that the Hebrew and Christian Scriptures enshrine the noblest concepts of religious doctrine given among men. The curriculum draws upon all that the Bible presents from out of a tried past, especially that

past represented in the experiences of the Master himself. But the curriculum is neither a Bible curriculum nor a doctrinal curriculum, primarily. It is primarily a child curriculum intending to provide the children with avenues of discovery, experience and practice by which to attain free selection of the truth of God and so to apply and absorb it into present life experience. We wish knowledge, but knowledge self gained, not imparted by authority. We encourage experiences whereby progressively to achieve judgments of religious truth which are according to self-discovered reality. We assume that child nature means children to become self avowed Christians and on this assumption we build toward conscious Christian discipleship and await the hour of personal majority when there is the resolute self-acknowledgement of Christ as older Brother, Ideal, Friend, and Saviour.

Our social aims in religious education, then, must always be checked by our individual aims. The social order is an objective with us, but it is not the primary objective. No child is to be sacrificed to the good of all. Social progress is made not at the expense of the development of individuals, but by means of it. In our curriculum we conduct our children into the social *milieu* and make them participants in our common life, but this procedure is first of all for the sake of the children themselves.

3. *Training in social living an essential part of religious education.*

Our objectives in social training have to do with such results as the taming of the beast in man, the rational control of financial greed, the culture of the sense of moral responsibility, the response of races to the ideal of human brotherhood, the acceptance of the trust principle as applied both to material and immaterial possessions, and the construction of a consciousness of inter-dependence among men. We aim at the training of a social conscience. Curricula must meet the test of social value. A religion with its citizenship only in heaven is no longer acceptable. In general education the crucial question is upon the training afforded through participating in the production of the common good. Doctor Bobbitt is representative of recent educational thought in saying, "The first problem—a most baffling one—is to draw up a curriculum that will with certainty forge an enduring and vitalized group consciousness."[1] In Doctor Bagley's *Educational Values* the social concept is one of the most decisive.[2] Such ideas are of the Spirit of Jesus, voiced at Nazareth synagogue, when he interpreted the central theme of the prophets as being the uplift of the common man.

In judging the religious curriculum such criteria as these are necessary: in Old Testament lessons is the weight upon the vital struggle reflected there in behalf of purer and simpler notions of

[1]Bobbitt, Franklin, **The Curriculum**, Houghton Mifflin, 1918, p. 130.
[2]Bagley, William C., **Educational Values**, MacMillan, 1922.

religion and in behalf of the oppressed; is adequate attention given to find among the Hebrew writings the roots of modern Christianity with its interest in government, rents, loans, hours, sanitation, health control, science, schools, churches; is right balance kept between the distant past and the recent past—do Huss, Calvin, Bunyan, Williams, Livingstone, Rauschenbusch and others become familiar to the children in proportion to their influence on religious history compared with the influence of Moses, Elijah and Amos; is search made for the religious reason and element in present day civic and social education so that children will find out the religious dynamic behind social progress? Particularly, what religious activities does the curriculum give a child to execute in common with others? And what social attitudes does it inspire? Does the curriculum advance stage by stage through kindergarten years to high school adolescence in discovering to the child the Christian norms of the family group, the beginners' circle, the school community, the whole community and the world brotherhood until the child may become a Christian world citizen?

4. *Immediate applicability.*

Does the material fit into the child's present needs and experience so that he can find use for it and is it such that he will desire to use it? Preparative learning is necessary but the concepts must be applicable, related to experience and capable of being utilized in present problems. Educational theory may not deny all value to formal discipline and transfer of training[1] but training must take advantage at every stage of childhood's interests and fit the lesson to the learner's life as he is now living it.

In the large, religious truth, like all truth, requires to be brought down from abstract doctrine and anticipative value to the level of the day's play and work. Teaching divorced from deeds is dead. Religion is theology lived.

What are the dominating interests which go straight to the heart of Four and Five? Do the lessons fit the capacities and respect the limitations of these children? Have the lesson writers sensed the conclusions worked out on the floor of the kindergarten regarding the material to be put into teachers' hands and minds? Similarly, do the courses for middle adolescents, where the leakage from schools and Sunday schools occurs, appeal and grip? Are lessons too young? Or are they too old? Youth lives largely, with many interests. Do the writers know these and touch them? Physical life, his group, debating, skepticism of formerly accepted standards, idealism, feeling, the

---

[1]Starch, Daniel, **Educational Psychology,** MacMillan, 1922, p. 255. "The content value of a subject must be the prime reason and the general disciplinary value the secondary reason for pursuing it."

progress of independent judgment—these and other typical characteristics of middle adolescence require accurate recognition. So in the case of each age.

It is by means of questions such as these, called for by the fundamental principles and necessities of religious education, that dependable criteria may be stated. From these questions an instrument of measurement may be made with which to score any curriculum materials and activities.

CHAPTER II

SCORE CARD FOR USE IN DETAILED EVALUATIONS OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION MATERIALS

The following score card is proposed as a working means of applying the necessary criteria to each unit of the Keystone Series or to other units and thereby of scoring excellences on a *per-milium* basis, reducible to percentages for the series as a whole. The exactness of the distribution of the one thousand points among the various parts of the score card is not regarded so important as the careful application of each applicable question thereunder to each unit of instruction and the presentation of consequent data. Account is also taken of the necessity of flexibility in applying any single score card to materials intended for pupils of different ages.

Indebtedness is acknowledged to three score cards, prepared, one by the Inter-Church World Movement, one by the International Sunday School Association, and one by the curriculum class of 1922-23 in religious education in Northwestern University in the making of which the present writer had part. Comparison may be made also with objectives 601-607 (Religious Attitudes and Activities) of the Major Objectives of Education as outlined in Bobbitt, Franklin, *How to Make a Curriculum*, Houghton Mifflin, 1924, pp. 25, 26, with a score card in Vol. II of the *Indiana Survey of Religious Education*, Doran, 1924, and with that in Betts, George Herbert, *The Curriculum of Religious Education*, Abingdon, 1924, pp. 343-349.

The one thousand points are distributed among one hundred and twenty-one questions as follows:

Mechanical Features, questions 1-5	50 points
Literary Features, questions 6-8	100 points
Content, judged by the needs of the individual, by the general demands of society and by the particular demands of the church, questions 9-72	500 points
Provisions to aid in learning, questions 73-92	200 points
Provisions to aid in teaching, questions 93-121	150 points

SCORE CARD

I Mechanical Features **50**

1. (1) Type: size, leading, word spacing, pleasing effect, (age levels considered) 10
2. (2) Attractiveness of page: clearance, pleasing arrangement, spacing, margins 10
3. (3) Organization of page: section headings, marginal insets, italics, black face, short line, all considered for emphasis and convenience 10
4. (4) Pictures: mechanical execution judged by clearness and proper use of color 10
5. (5) Form and binding judged by convenience and durability 10

II Literary Features **100**

6. (1) Merit judged by literary technique evident, beauty of style, elegance of diction, skillful climax, dramatic pull, human interest 40
7. (2) Merit judged by appropriateness of style to age of children: vocabulary, simplicity, clearness, general tone, method of approach 40
8. (3) Merit of pictures and music used or indicated to be judged by fitness to age and by artistic merit 20

III Content **500**

Materials judged by the needs of the children **250**

9. (1) Aim—evidence of the functioning of an aim fitted to the age, experience, capacities, limitations and needs of the children 50

(2) Materials—to be judged by such questions as follow:

(Category of knowledge)

10. Do the materials give sufficient knowledge of Christ as a living friend and helper of the children and youth to enable them to come confidently to him for inspiration and strength in their daily living?
11. Do they appeal to children, stimulate, invite and inspire them to learn more of religion, gain a growing acquaintance with God at work throughout all time, an increasing understanding of Christ and his teachings and a knowledge of the great leaders of biblical and other literature?
12. Is the balance between biblical and other materials just, in view of the values thereof? 50

(Category of attitudes)

13. Are the materials suited to lead to an appreciation of the attractiveness of a genuine religious life, of reverence for God, of love for Christ, respect for self and others and an attitude of happiness and helpful service in the world?
14. Is there suitable stimulus toward the self-commitment of the children to avowed Christian discipleship and church membership?
15. Is there suitable material to make individual worship desirable?
16. Are the materials fitted to strengthen the sense of personal responsibility?

17. Are they calculated to leave the children with a desire to live over into their conduct the truths and ideals they have learned?
18. Is there material sufficient and rightly placed in the course to motivate the religious choice of a life work, adequate preparation therefor and faithful prosecution thereof?
19. Is the Christian attitude toward physical vigor and purity rightly emphasized?
20. Do the materials lead toward a sense of shame, guilt and sorrow for wrong doing? 50

(Category of habits)

21. Do the materials stimulate and attract toward a life of habitual truth-telling, purity of mind, honesty, kindness, helpfulness, industry, service?
22. Are the materials suitable for training in group and personal worship?
23. Are the memory materials chosen with a view to intelligibility, age interests, appeal, beauty, and present or preparative religious value as suggested by the questions herein?
24. Are right habits in the use of work time, leisure time and money constructively encouraged?
25. Are the materials well calculated to help establish the habit of thinking through to self-formed conclusions in matters of religious faith and conduct? 50

(3) Correlation with the children's activities at home and school:

26. Do the materials parallel the materials of corresponding grade in the public schools, in interest, orderly progression and educational value?
27. Do the materials supply constant points of contact with the children's everyday activities and interests?
28. Is there fitness of materials to carry over into the daily conduct and personal character of the children?
29. Is there sufficient emphasis placed by the materials upon the influence their religion should have in the children's home activities and attitudes? 50

Materials judged by the demands of society.....125

30. (1) Aim—Does the general aim include that of fitting the children to live as Christians in the world as it is and to affect the world's life in the direction of the coming kingdom of Christ?..... 25

(2) Materials—to be judged by such questions as follow:

(Category of knowledge)

31. Are the materials fitted to give adequate knowledge of the principles of Christian living in a world hostile to these principles?
32. Do the materials furnish a knowledge of Christ's ideals of a right society and do they sufficiently emphasize his announced purposes of religious conquest in the world?
33. Do the materials sufficiently review history to reveal the work of God in the world's progress until now? Is there sympathy or hostility to the concept of development in history?
34. Are the best religious materials of the past drawn upon as deposited in myths, legends, poems, wisdom literature, music, art, drama and hymns presented as monuments of the upward struggle of individuals and races?

35. Are the present movements and forces of the world presented and evaluated in their relation to the Kingdom of Christ?
36. Is instruction provided in the principles of the Christian stewardship of money, time, influence, birth, knowledge, opportunity?
37. Is there place in the curriculum for the presentation of the foundations of a right industrial order? 25
38. Do the materials adequately present the Christian principles which ought to underly business?

(Category of attitudes)

39. Do the materials clearly and attractively set forth the essentially unselfish character of Christ's way of life in such a manner as to inspire a living purpose to follow him in his life of helpfulness to others?
40. Is provision made for the fostering of the attitude of brotherhood toward all (aliens, strangers, Orientals, colored races)?
41. Do the materials foster such an international consciousness that the ideals of a brotherhood of nations and international justice in the modern world are adequately presented?
42. Do the allusions of the material to war and its heroes make for an attitude of disapproval and horror for the injustice, cruelty, deception and destruction of war while inspiring idealism, unselfishness and devotion to the right? (Is Old Testament war so presented as to leave the dominant impression that of righteousness?)
43. Is the heroism of daily life, of ordinary service, of family devotion, of friendship, of industrial faithfulness, of public trust, of the cause of Christian missions emphasized sufficiently to provide ethical substitute for the war spirit, to sublimate the fighting instinct and to preserve the values of conflict?
44. Are the achievements of foreign peoples in art, literature, government, and religion appreciated and drawn upon for illustrative material?
45. Is the sense of individual and group responsibility for community conditions adequately fostered in the materials?
46. Do the lessons adequately suggest the Christian ideals of exalted relations between the sexes, of monogamy, of virtuous home life, of family loyalty, of filial and parental obligation?
47. Is the spirit of neighborliness, self denial, courtesy, helpfulness toward the needy, the helpless and little children taught? 25

(Category of habits)

48. Are the materials suited to lead children and youth to a play life that is wholesome, recreative, giving opportunity for the development of the higher instincts and capacities and for the exercise of habits of fairness, whole-heartedness, co-operation?
49. Is participation by the children in betterment movements and campaigns and in civic responsibilities properly encouraged in the materials?
50. Is there provision for the encouragement of habits of giving for the relief of distress and the introduction of the kingdom of Christ among all people?
51. Is there suitable recognition of the obligation to care for and to make right use of community property (play-grounds, parks, roadways, water, library, public buildings and privileges)?
52. Do the materials relate the school life and play life of the children with religion so that the maintenance of right habits of work and of play will be a religious experience?

53. Are habits of respectful speech encouraged toward and concerning persons both of high and of lowly station (elders, equals, servants, employers, officials)? 25

(3) Correlation.

54. Is the religious curriculum conceived in terms of co-operation with the home?
55. Are projects provided for participation in general effort for better social conditions?
56. Are such subjects as civics, commerce, history, sanitation and health, occurring in the public school curriculum, recognized in the materials of the religious curriculum as having a bearing upon the introduction of the conditions demanded by the kingdom of God?
57. Is attempt made in the materials to correlate the literary values of religious writings with the values of general literature?
58. Do the materials connect religious and secular history so that there appears a unity in all history?
59. Is science recognized and valued at its true worth as contributor to the solidarity of modern life, the defender of fact and a leader in faithful investigation? 25

Materials judged by the claims of the church.....125

60. (1) Aim—Does the general aim propose to fit the children for active membership in the church?..... 25

(2) Materials—to be judged by such questions as follow:

(Category of knowledge)

61. Are the materials adequate to afford acquaintance with the history of the Christian church, its foundation, the development of its doctrines, practices, errors and achievements?
62. Are the materials calculated to give a just knowledge of the ideal of a church as projected by Christ?
63. Are the materials sufficient to acquaint the children and youth with the growth and with the present task of their own section of the Christian church?
64. Is there adequate information upon the practical conduct of church affairs and organization?
65. Do the materials provide for adequate instruction in hymns and orders of worship used by the church and church school?..... 25

(Category of attitudes)

66. Are the materials calculated to foster in the children and youth the attitudes of loyalty to their own church, just pride in its progress, jealousy for its reputation, and concern for the victory of the church at large in the spiritual conquest of the world?
67. Are breadth of sympathy and the spirit of tolerance toward those of differing religious thought or practice inculcated?
68. Is an expectation encouraged that the children shall themselves have a part and place in the church?
69. Are the materials suited to deepen the spirit of co-operation (within the church and between churches)?..... 25

(Category of habits)

70. Are the materials fitted to encourage habits of participating in the life and activities of the church (its worship, its school, its financial enterprises)?
71. Do the materials emphasize the essentially missionary function of the church and provide for cultivating the habit of effort to lead the un-churched to Christ and to Christian fellowship?..... 25

(3) Correlation.

72. Are the materials constructed with a view to the progressive incorporation of the children into the actual program and conduct of the church so that their knowledge of its history, purposes and spirit may pass over into experience? 25

IV Pedagogical Provisions to Aid the Learner.....200

(1) Organization of the material about an aim 40

73. This aim consistently followed throughout each yearly unit?
74. Each lesson definitely organized to secure the co-operative achievement, by teachers and pupils, of a definite aim?

(2) Proper use of various types or forms of lesson organization..... 40

75. Is the type of organization fitted to pupils and to materials (instruction, discussion, story, project)?
76. Is variety afforded?
77. Is point of contact provided, pupil's apperception mass considered?
78. Is the principle of stress and neglect honored?

(3) Provisions for controlling study 40

79. Effective assignment (so made as to motivate and direct study)?
80. Questions, problems and topics provided for guiding study?
81. Valuable references for home reading and means for checking these up or otherwise motivating them?
82. Provision for supervising, or otherwise explicitly directing study?
83. Means for rewarding, and thus encouraging home study?
84. Are the lessons so organized as to encourage and reward participation by pupils?

(4) Provisions for insuring functioning of instruction in daily life and conduct of pupils..... 40

85. Are truths and principles taught definitely related to every day life?
86. Are activities or lines of action suggested expressive of ideals presented?
87. Is drill arranged for to bring to the point of habit or skill such reactions as call for them (group worship, with appropriate forms thereof, memorizing, social co-operation, dramatization)?
88. Is training provided for in applying general standards to specific individual or social conduct and so in carrying over instruction into experience?

(5) Provisions for enriching and expanding experience beyond the lesson 40

89. Suggestions for related supplementary stories, talks, addresses, readings, investigations, writing or service undertakings?
90. Incidental reference to great men or important events: allusions to great art, literature or music; quotations from poetry or fine prose; cross references to history, geography, etc.?
91. Valuable contributions to the vocabulary of the pupils, by the enrichment of old terms or by the introduction of new?
92. Hand or expression work with motives beyond that of merely clinching the lesson (as for pleasure, interest or general enrichment)?

V Pedagogical Provisions to Aid the Teacher.....150

Teaching helps involved in the organization of the book as a whole.... 75

(1) Valuable teaching suggestions additional to those that constitute an integral part of each lesson (as in an introductory chapter or scattered in short notices throughout the book):

93. Are the psychologically determined characteristics of which each yearly unit must take account, adequately presented?
94. Is there adequate presentation of the sociological demands met at each age?
95. Is sufficient consideration given to the claims of the church to afford teachers an intelligent grasp of the problems and purposes involved?
96. Are there lists of library books, stories and articles suitable to recommend to pupils of the age dealt with for their private or reference reading?
97. Is there general bibliography with suggestions for the wider reading of the teacher?
98. Are there general suggestions as to how to prepare and conduct the lessons?

(2) Supplementary teaching material as required:

99. Maps, charts? Supplementary pictures?
100. Music presented in the series or indicated for use?
101. Index, glossary, pronouncing dictionary?
102. Notebooks, handwork materials, etc., when needed?
103. Provision of report forms or suggested letters or other means for keeping teacher, children and homes intelligently co-operating in carrying out the aims of the course?

(3) Provisions for giving the teacher perspective on the course:

104. Account of the particular aim of the unit in hand and of how it fits into the course as a whole?
105. Description of the equipment needed (with information also of desirable additional material) and where to get it, cost, etc.?

(4) Provisions for review:

106. Review materials spaced at most useful intervals?
107. Materials organized for well conducted reviews?

Teaching helps involved in the individual lessons 75

108. (1) A separate manual for teachers for each unit?

(2) Valuable supplementary material for teachers:

109. Additional information for the sake of perspective?
110. References for further professional and content reading?
111. Additional story or other material supplied, or teacher referred to it?

(3) Useful teaching suggestions:

112. Suggestions for distribution of emphasis (what to stress, what to have memorized, etc.)
113. Suggestions for relating lesson to pupil's age or interests?
114. Suggestions upon how to prepare and conduct the lesson in hand?
115. As to how to make assignments?
116. For controlling study (for motivating it, checking it up, directing it)?

(4) Valuable teaching aids:

117. Suggestive questions for conduct of recitation, or review?
118. Useful model lesson plans?
119. Suggested topics, problems, or projects to be assigned for home work?
120. Suggestions for summing up or applying the lesson?
121. Provision of program material other than that of the lesson (songs, games, orders of worship or prayers written for age involved)?

CHAPTER III

DETAILED EVALUATIONS OF THE KEYSTONE TEXTS

The General Aims of the Keystone graded lessons, built upon topics and biblical materials selected by the International Lesson Committee, are identical with the aims published by the Committee:

To meet the spiritual needs of the pupil in each stage of his development. The spiritual needs, broadly stated, are these:

1. To know God as he has revealed himself to us in nature and in Christ.
2. To exercise towards God, the Father, and his Son, Jesus Christ, our Lord and Saviour, trust, obedience and worship.
3. To know and to do our duty to others.
4. To know and to do our duty to ourselves.

What of the validity and functional applicability of these aims? Since they were formulated we have gone much farther in analysis of the "needs of the pupil" and have conceived our total aim in terms both of the child and of the social whole of which he is a part.

Acquaintance with God, particularly through Christ's ideals, way of life and entire impact upon us must always be the initial Christian aim in education. But this acquaintance must also be made a means toward further educational ends lying in the realms of motivation, attitude, purpose, response, activity, habit.

Further, acquaintance with God is not the only form of religious knowledge. Respect for self and for human life in its almost infinite variety is based upon religious knowledge of one's own life and one's neighbors, far and near. Doing our duty to ourselves and others is not an adequate religious statement of human relations. Nor is it explicit. Trust, loyalty and reverence toward men are as truly a religious program as are trust, obedience and worship toward God. For those who conceive religious education in Christian terms, account now has to be taken of the supreme Christian conception, for individuals or for society, Jesus' conception of the Kingdom of God.

1. *The Unit for Children Four and Five Years Old, "The Little Child and the Heavenly Father."*

The aims both of the International Lesson Committee and of the Keystone Series are formally stated, for this unit, in the words "To know God, the Heavenly Father, who loves him (the little child), provides for and protects him; to know Jesus, the Son of God, who became a little child, who went about doing good, and who is the Friend and

Saviour of little children; to know about the heavenly home; to distinguish right from wrong; to show his love for God by working for him". These aims, stated thus rather religiously than pedagogically, are more educationally stated in the teachers' manuals in serial fashion as each of the successive themes of instruction is reached, in an effort to relate the teaching to the progressive needs of the children rather than to the successive claims of the assigned lessons.

The materials for the children consist of a four page folder, perforated but with no cover provided, intended to be taken home by the children at the close of the school each week. The first page usually carries, within a design of flowers, fruit and birds, a 3¼x4 inch cut, full page, illustrating the day's story, printed on pages three and four. Page two shows the day's Scripture verse, with chapter and verse stated in a small type, the verse framed in a design new each week, and with color. At the end is a selection of verse correlated with the day's story, in a few of the folders, with music. Finally, suggestions to mothers are made.

Eight teachers' manuals are provided, averaging 97 pages, 6¼x8 inches, on high grade paper, of good type and make up, but in paper cover. The successive discussions of the twenty-five themes are, in fact, considerations of the unfolding life of the child and an effort to designate how to make the stories contribute to his religious development. They command respect by their analysis of the progressive religious needs of children. They show a necessary effort to meet these needs within the lines of a prescribed program of lessons. In a very few instances the lessons leave the international base in favor of nature materials or materials better adapted to the age.

Mechanical features (Score Card, Sec. I). In mechanical execution there is good typography but make-up and illustrations fall to a low grade in contrast with the best non religious materials offered the general public for children of this age. Color work should be extended. A good cover should be provided. Parents may be expected to pay for attractive materials at this time in a child's life. This unit is scored*: 8 (out of a possible 10 for question 1); 5 (out of a possible 10 for question 2); (question 3 not applicable); 5 (out of a possible 10 for question 4); 2 (out of a possible 10 for question 5): total 20 (out of a possible 40). Result 50%.

Literary features (Score Card, Sec. II). Two levels of literary value appear in the stories, corresponding to two copyright dates of production, the later superior in point of beauty, touch, and cumulative

*In the scoring a rate is given each item which receives a rate in the score card. The rate given is compared in parenthesis with the highest rate allowed in the score card; the actual rating and highest possible rating are then totaled for each major division of the score card and percentage of excellence is thus shown.

pull. The adaptation of pictures to age usually shows good choice. Works of art of child interest alternate with photographs of children and out-door scenes. A richer selection of music is desired, of quality and age adaptation at least equal to that chosen. For literary values this unit is scored: 30 (40); 35 (40); 10 (20): total 75 (100). Result 75%.

Content (Score Card, Sec. III). In content the demands of childhood are discovered to be carefully weighed, presented and made the principle of guidance within the limitations imposed by lessons already selected and themes already decided upon. There is a painful dilemma between consciousness of the child and the pressing succession of incidents to be taught. For example, an attempt is made to foster in the children a sense of the loving protection of the Father where three successive prescribed lessons might easily bring an undesired religious reaction in response to the extremity of Hagar and Ishmael, the den of lions and the divine judgment of the deluge. The inclusion of these stories must of course be charged not to the Keystone but to the International basic list. To the score card questions Nos. 10 and 11 whether Christ is central in the religion presented for the children's acceptance it may be said that the Old Testament story greatly predominates. There are nineteen nature stories of a total of eighty-one. The attitudes of trust in God's care, love for Christ, happiness and helpfulness are all abundantly cultivated. One lesson aims "to make prayer seem to the children something both desirable and necessary to their happiness and well-being." There are four obedience stories and four about "children helping." Immediacy of application usually marks the treatment of the stories. They are "calculated to leave the children with a desire to live over into their conduct the truths and ideals they have learned," as the score card asks in question 17. Habits of giving thanks, loving obedience, kindness to others, to the helpless and to animals are aimed at, and home suggestions in these directions are attempted. The Keystone considerably simplifies the International designations of memory materials and in the direction of present value. Correlation with daily life, activities and interests is constantly attempted. The scoring follows: aim 40 (50); knowledge 35 (50); attitudes 45 (50); activities 40 (50); correlation 40 (50): total 200 (250). Result 80% for content provision for the demands of childhood.

The social aims and methods of this unit must be judged in terms of the home circle and the kindergarten floor. The family motif recurs constantly. Seasonal, general and every day dramatizations are suggested. Too little is made of the social possibilities in the children's giving of money. There are, both on the side of instruction and on that of attitude, provisions for the beginnings of industrial understanding, missionary responsibility, the sanctity of home, devotion to the weak, and responsibility for helpful cooperation. The scoring upon content, social values, follows: for aim, 15 (25); for knowledge

20 (25); for attitudes, 15 (25); for activities, 20 (25); for correlation, 22 (25): total 92 (125). Result 73%.

In preparation for church membership and church cooperation the materials of this unit emphasize the finding of God as the cohesive central discovery of the kindergarten circle. Loving common loyalty to the group is a definite aim. There is lack of adequate teaching upon the essential place of cooperative giving of money and upon the essentially missionary nature of all giving to Christ. Upon worship and loyalty the materials are strong, upon giving and missionary correlation they are weak. The scoring becomes 15 (25) on aim; 15 (25) on knowledge; 20 (25) on attitudes; 15 (25) on habit; 20 (25) on correlation: total 85 (125). Result 68% on preparative church training.

Pedagogical provisions to help the pupils. (Score Card, Sec. IV). In scoring the unit upon provisions to help the learner the child's life, rather than the materials, is found to be kept before the writers. In form of organization, however, the materials are story-rich as they should be but project-poor as they should not be. The impression is given that there is too little variety. Are too many concepts attempted in these hundred lessons? In matters of home reviews, application and motivation, much effort is well placed to suggest to mothers various ways of affording the children expressional activities. "Home Games and Occupations to Continue Sunday Teaching" are always printed in full in the teacher's manual, but should also be printed for the mother. The point of lack is in failure to provide any system of check upon home training. Drill is ineffective at intervals of a week. The curriculum should take account of children's every day activities and should provide definite system to utilize all progress made toward religious instruction, motivation and habituation throughout the children's entire experience. The results of the scoring in part IV of the score card are 35 (40); 30 (40); 20 (40); 35 (40); 30 (40): total 150 (200). Result 75%.

Pedagogical helps for teachers. (Score Card, Sec. V). In those features of the unit intended to help teachers there is lack of adequate instruction to give a grasp either of the psychological factors with which they must deal, of the social necessities which religious education must face and endeavor to meet or of the problems and purposes of the curriculum, looking toward the future citizenship of the church. An inadequate psychological bibliography is appended. Mothers' books should be indicated, described, outlined and priced. Much more of information, direction and discussion should be included in the materials brought home by the children as to the objectives and methods of religious training for little children, with specific suggestions for parents. Pictures, usually those of the child's folder, enlarged to 9½x12½ inches, a few of them in color, are provided, one for each week. The score on provision of material to aid in teaching becomes

45 (75) for general material and 65 (75) for material accompanying the individual lessons: total 110 (150). Result 73%.

The scoring for the age 4, 5 unit is:

Mechanical execution	50
Literary technique	75
Content, the individual	80
Content, society	73
Content, the church	68
Provisions for the learner	75
Provisions for the teacher	73
Mean for the beginners' unit	70

2. *The Age Six Unit, "Stories About God's Gifts."*

This course, formerly called Primary First Year, is now called Course I, corresponding to public school grade one. It was revised in 1920 by Nan F. Weeks at the request of Mrs. Lamoreaux, the original writer, in 1909.

The aim is "to show forth God's power, love and care, and to awaken, within the child, responsive love, trust and obedience." The "previews" stating the stages of purpose, theme by theme, through the year, contain little of child description and much of topical purpose. For all the undeniably fine sense of the heart of childhood there are only a few statements in these previews, however true, which could be called psychological, and the procedure is topical—biblical rather than by means of a modern analysis of the capacities, limitations, tendencies, interests and needs of childhood. The aim of helping the child to progress by social adjustment and the ultimate aim of a socialized individual do not find large employment in this unit.

The child's materials consist of a folder less expensive than that for the previous years. The folder is planned to be used at an opening handwork period on the Sunday following that when its story was told. It is to be handed the child finally at the time of going home. The project of making covers is suggested. No color appears. The principal story is featured. Space is usually provided for drawing or for the insertion of a picture or for the completion of a design. A limited number of musical selections are given in full. For teachers, fifty-two pictures are provided, on 8x5½ inch paper. These are correlated with the year's lessons. Cut-out sheets presenting small pictures for handwork mounting are included. The teachers' manuals total 593 pages for the year. Thirteen themes are developed. A feature unique in the entire series is the inclusion of a weekly missionary story.

Mechanics. (Score Card, Sec. I). The mechanical execution of this unit is inferior to its predecessor, a most unfortunate fact at the moment when the children receive their first public school materials. The detailed score is 7 (10) on typography, etc.; 4 (10) an attractive-

ness; 4 (10) on page organization; 2 (10) on pictures including those noted among teaching helps; 4 (10) on form and building: total 21 (50). Percentage result on mechanical features 42%.

Literary excellence. (Score Card, Sec. II). In literary quality excellence has been allowed to suffer for the sake of content. Among the pictures there are too many instances of poverty of artistic merit. The twenty-two musical compositions range in quality from high to low. Score: 20 (40) on literary technique; 30 (40) on adaptation of pictures and music: total 60 (100). Percentage 60% on literary features.

Content. (Score Card, Sec. III). In content, individual values, the predominant point of view is that of theme. There are two foci, the biblical and the missionary. There is little provision for training in conduct standards suited to age or for concrete conduct suggestions whereby to carry into practice the high ideals and attitudes presented. The course is not rich in illustrations of right and helpful doing on the play-ground and at home. Score: 25 (50) on aim; 20 (50) on knowledge; 35 (50) on attitudes; 35 (50) on habit; 28 (50) on correlation. Total 143 (250). Result 57%.

In content, social values, the scoring is lower. Neither social life as a means toward the educative process nor social life as an end of education seems clearly in view. In the lesson on Naaman's bravery his courage is praised, but his business is not condemned. The unit is strong upon the heroism of daily life but weak at the point of appreciation of the excellences and achievements of the many lesser breeds without the law whose representatives people the pages of the many missionary stories. Much thought has been given to correlation with home life but almost none to the problem of relating religious with general public education. Religious ideals, motives and standards are not related to play life, whereby a large segment of the child's normal life is missed and he is left to suppose that being a Christian and having a good time are two unrelated matters. Any right theory of play makes it the normal expression of the child's nature which gives religion the high opportunity to introduce here its approvals, guidance and training—to utilize play as a field of religious experience. The score upon social values of content is: aim 10 (25); instruction 10 (25); attitudes 16 (25); activities 15 (25); correlation 15 (25). Total 66 (125). Percentage 52%.

Materials upon the missionary task of the church are abundant, cooperative attitudes are constantly cultivated but provision for worship is not developed. Of twenty-two musical selections one-fourth are not well calculated to train in worship. Upon preparation for church membership the scoring is: 20 (25); 15 (25); 18 (25); 17 (25); 15 (25): total 85 (125). Percentage 68%.

Provisions in aid of the pupils. (Score Card, Sec. IV). As a project for helping the children to realize the exalted ethical and religious principles of the lessons in their own multiform life, the unit cannot rank high. This lack the unit endeavors to make up by its high level of instruction and its abounding wealth of stories. Score: 20 (40); 30 (40); 15 (40); 20 (40); 25 (40). Total 110 (200). Percentage 55%.

Pedagogy in aid of teachers. (Score Card, Sec. V). In providing for its teachers the weakness of the unit lies in its failure adequately to set forth the psychologically determined demands of children, the social values at stake and the relation of the year to the child's expanding experience of the church. There is a bare bibliography. Score 48 (95); 35 (75). Total 83 (150). Percentage 55%.

The scoring for the six-year unit is:

Mechanical features	42
Literary value	60
Content, the individual	57
Content, society	52
Content, the church	68
Provision for the learner	55
Provision for the teacher	55
Average for the first grade text	55

3. *The Unit for Seven-Year-Old Children, "Stories About God's Helpers."*

The sound educational ideals of this unit are indicated, in the fourfold aim of the missionary stories, to be (1) to emphasize and illustrate the truth which the Bible story (of each lesson) itself teaches; (2) to build up week by week a background of child life in our own and other lands; (3) to show how missionaries bring light, hope and happiness to those whom they serve; (4) to arouse and develop a sympathetic interest in the children of the world, and a desire to help them through gifts and service. The author further says: "A normal child's life, like that of an adult, should have four supreme avenues of self-expression, viz: work, play, love, worship. Through these he gains two important things: mastery over himself and the power to serve humanity and God." Several pages are used in discussion of concentration, the lure of the story, the child's expression, handwork, the play side of the child, and story dramatization, presenting a well conceived approach for the untrained teacher.

The child's folder now has eight pages, the missionary story being printed in full each week, usually with pictures. All stories told are within the abilities of second grade children. Cuts from photographs as well as lithographed Bible scenes abound. Marginal designs and handwork outlines occur, for coloring or sewing. Home work is

indicated. No supplementary pictures or other material are issued. Twenty-five of the fifty-two Bible stories are from the New Testament.

Mechanical quality. (Score Card, Sec. I). It is unfortunate that a unit of such pedagogical value must suffer from mechanical demerit, shown especially in its pictures. The two parts of the unbound and uncovered folder are left to the hazard of separation. The score on mechanical quality is: 8 (10); 6 (10); 9 (10); 1 (10); 4 (10). Total 28 (50). Percentage 56%.

Literary quality. (Score Card, Sec. II). The stories are marked by a fine feeling for childhood, possess beauty, good diction, interest. The most conspicuous lack is in artistic pictures and music. The score allowed for artistic quality is 25 (40); 30 (40); 5 (20). Total 60 (100). Percentage 60%.

Content. (Score Card, Sec. III). The unit is child centered. It accepts guidance from child nature itself. The unit is as strong in its fitness to achieve attitudes as in its fitness to impart knowledge. The instructional quality is high and there is attraction toward worship and toward personal responsibility and helpfulness. The grading on content, individual values, is 45 (50); 40 (50); 45 (50); 40 (50); 40 (50). Total 210 (250). Result 84%.

In being child centered the unit has failed to qualify highly in its preparative social value. The aim itself is not adequately socialized. The conception of religion seems to be individualistic without being also that of conquest in the world and that of social development. The rescue motive, tempered somewhat by child fellowship, dominates the missionary stories, an inadequate present day emphasis. Moses opposed slavery and interposed to relieve the industrial handicap of womanhood. Jesus' "peace on earth" nativity was more than a wish for individualistic inner peace. The lessons failed here. But the unit has declared attitude the head of the corner in religious education and has worked by fertile suggestion and trained skill toward that end. Score: 15 (25); 10 (25); 22 (25); 10 (25); 20 (25). Total 75 (125). Result 62% for social value.

There is notable inadequancy of materials calculated to inspire and train the children in common worship. The music is didactic. There is almost no provision for habituation at this very important point. Upon preparative training toward church membership the unit scores: 20 (25); 20 (25); 20 (25); 15 (25); 13 (25). Total 88 (125). Result 70%.

Child helps. (Score Card, Sec. IV). The organization of material is adapted to age. Variety, stress and neglect, the apperception mass are all remembered. Careful check is provided for, as are suggestions for dramatization. On pedagogical excellence the scoring is 35 (40); 40 (40); 33 (40); 26 (40); 11 (40). Total 145 (200). Result 72%.

Teachers' helps. (Score Card, Sec. V). In the teachers' materials a high point of excellence is the careful working out of reviews. The lessons are well inter-correlated. Teachers' note book suggestions are made. There is careful analysis of aim. There is always a lesson plan, usually a second or alternate plan. Sometimes a third. The score for teaching organization is 45 (75); 56 (75). Total 101 (150). Result 67%.

The score for the seven-year-old unit has become:

Mechanical quality	42
Artistic values	60
Content, the child	84
Content, society	62
Content, the church	70
Childrens' helps	72
Teachers' helps	67
Average for Course II	65

4. *The Unit for Children of Eight Years, "Stories About God's Will."*

The aims of this course must be gleaned from the lessons as presented.

The eight-page child's folder is like that for the previous year. There are many cuts both of children in ideal situations having missionary or daily interest and of situations correlated with the lessons. The Bible lesson story appears in full and usually also the missionary story. A home work suggestion may be made, a poem inserted, or blank lines left to be filled by the children from hints given. A page is usually reserved for "handwork" with directions therefor. The memory materials are given a prominent or attractive setting, and a few musical selections occur. The International basic material is changed in several instances. In the teachers' manuals the materials of general guidance are limited to three pages concerning pupils' folders, lesson pictures, class blackboard and handwork materials and methods, followed by a four-page statement upon missions in the primary department. The lessons are presented to teachers upon a plan which is usually unvaried.

Mechanics. (Score Card, Sec. I). The course resembles its predecessor in its lack of high mechanical quality, especially in its illustrations. The page organization is hardly so good as before. The score is 8 (10);.6 (10); 8 (10); 1 (10); 4 (10). Total 27 (50). Result 54%.

Literary standards. (Score Card, Sec. II). There is much of beauty and attractiveness in the stories, which try to adapt themselves to children. The unit is almost poor in musical treasure. Half the thirteen compositions are suitable for worship, half didactic. There is a failure to provide pictures the best that might be had. The unit

scores 25 (40); 25 (40); 10 (20). Total 60 (100). Result 60% for literary and artistic values.

Content. (Score Card, Sec. III). Upon content, evaluation discovers that the point of departure is the subject matter rather than the child. The unit is at its best in the category of knowledge. There is less pull than there is good example and abundant precept, story-wrapped. The atmosphere and method are sermonic, happily so but so. Prayer becomes understood and desirable rather than attractive. There is a sombre cast. The year is a year of God's will. If this is not just childhood's tone religious education has lost an opportunity. The detailed scoring is 25 (50); 45 (50); 30 (50); 27 (50); 29 (50). Total 156 (250). Result 60% for the individual interest in content.

Socially the point of view falls short. Score card question 31 asks whether suitable knowledge is afforded of the principles of Christian living in a world hostile to these principles. To this and to each subsequent question under the social knowledge group of questions an unfavorable answer must be scored. The portrait of Christ reveals to the children his essential altruism, but children of the third public school grade are capable of responding to wider implications of religion than the individual ones. The scoring upon content socially judged must be 15 (25); 5 (25); 16 (25); 5 (25); 5 (25). Total 46 (125). Result 36%.

The early history of the church is emphasized. The missionary function of the church is stressed as an effort to lead idolators and unfavored people to the knowledge and worship of the true God. Sympathy and respect motivate the missionary task less than pity. The practice of group worship seems little contemplated. Beyond question it is the aim to fit the children for the church and to move toward their incorporation into its active life, but there is too little correlation of definite experiences with the teachings offered or with the church itself. Score 20 (25); 14 (25); 17 (25); 10 (25); 10 (25). Total 71 (125). Result 57% for training toward church membership.

Children's pedagogy. (Score Card, Sec. IV). In pedagogy the aim seems to terminate upon instruction and attitude. The procedure consists most largely in the giving of information. There is little variety in method, more in subject matter. Effort to adapt the thing said and the way of saying it to the child's age sometimes results in a level too young. The filling out of incompleted memory lines and unfinished story condensations are not challenging as home work. The carrying over of ideals and standards into conduct is the point of greatest weakness in the course. The unit scores 12 (40); 20 (40); 10 (40); 10 (40); 10 (40) on helps for the children. Total 62 (200). Result 31%.

Teachers' padagogy. (Score Card, Sec. V). There are no provisions for summary and application of the lesson nor for review. No

attempt is made to secure cooperation between school and home, as desirable now as it was two or three years previous. Almost no attractive activities are assigned and no means of checking up on or reward of home activities are offered. In general the unit is seriously at loss for lack of discussing the needs, characteristics, potentialities, interests and limitations of children of the age. Nor are the social aspects of education considered. The score upon the teaching organization of the unit is 23 (75); 19 (75). Total 42 (150). Result 28%.

Upon the entire unit the scoring has been:

Mechanical quality	54
Artistic quality	60
Content, the child	60
Content, society	36
Content, the church	57
Pedagogy for child	31
Pedagogy for teacher	28
Mean for the age eight unit	46

5. *Materials for Ages Nine, Ten and Twelve.*

These three units are of single authorship and are alike in pedagogical organization. The titles are *"Stories of the Long Ago," "Old Testament Stories"* and *"The Great Leader."*

The general aim is, "through the teaching of God's Word and through opportunities for expressional activities, to help each pupil to become a doer as well as a hearer of the Word. To lead each one to accept Jesus Christ as Saviour and Friend and Lord." The specific aims are "To deepen and strengthen the impulse to choose the right in thought, in word and in deed; and to arouse an interest in and a love for God's book. To show the consequences of right and wrong choices; to encourage love of the right and hatred of the wrong. To present the ideal of moral heroism; to portray Jesus Christ in his power and majesty as the greatest Hero of all ages; through the stories of his faithful followers, to awaken a spirit of loyalty and service. To present Jesus as Saviour and Leader and Friend; to awaken an ever increasing desire for a life of service." In pursuance of these aims the materials of the International have been greatly altered. Several valuable missionary biographical lessons have been omitted. There is advocacy of missionary education, knowledge, attitude and expression, but there is provision neither for regular instruction nor are adequate channels for expression emphasized.

Each pupil is to receive his text each third month and a note book or work book. The Junior years, nine, ten, eleven, have a text 8½x6½ inches with a type line of 125 mm. The three years following have books 8½x5 inches with the more usual 90 mm. line. The note books of like appearance and quality with the texts are designed to be used

two pages for each week, for a record of the pupil's own impressions and learnings. In the text also, blanks and questions are indicated for completion or answer day by day as designated each week, this under the caption: Something to Do at Home. Other often used captions for home work are: Something to Know; Learn-a-bit; Work-a-bit; Think-a-bit. There is cumulative difficulty. Puzzles are used. The questions and problems are almost always directly correlated with the Bible material definitely indicated.

In the teachers' manuals the pedagogical point of view is shown in sections headed: aims; class use of the Bible; the possibilities of the work books; the correlative lesson; the Junior courses; some Junior characteristics; the teacher; aids to the promotion of reverence; variety; birthdays; incentives; missionary education; promotion requirements. "Correlative lessons" are brief lessons at the opening of each class session intended to introduce the children to the Bible and its parts and to acquaint them with its use as a book. Appendices state the year's lessons, give a teachers' book list, include a suggested service of worship with directions for a Junior choir, and print memory hymns. The twelve-year teachers' manuals add sections concerning the twelve-year-olds, honor work, the writer of the gospel of Mark and upon the gospel itself. By honor work is meant definitely suggested projects such as illustrating a hymn, making a model of an Oriental house, or a pulp relief map of Palestine or the writing of a lesson story. For each lesson there are stated a clearly defined aim, quotations "from the commentators," a "personal" message, a suggested lesson approach and lesson development, the lesson's message or central value, and a carefully planned "closing moment."

Mechanical quality. (Score Card, Sec. I). Physical appearance, paper, type, and organization of page are all good. Nothing is cramped. Five fonts of type are employed. The books are too wide. The pictures are poorly done and the pamphlet style of binding vitiates much of the impression. The score on mechanics for years 9, 10 is: 9 (10); 8 (10); 8 (10); 2 (10); 5 (10). Total 32 (50). Result 64%. For year 12 the score is 7 (10); 6 (10); 6 (10); 1 (10); 5 (10). Total 25 (50). Result 50%.

Literary value. (Score Card, Sec. II). The story has disappeared from the pupils' books, but imagination remains. Doing now fills the stage in the pupils' books, but in the teachers' manuals the entire range of literary values is drawn upon from Kipling to the unknown. A few pictures have artistic quality, as Tissot (without color) and Sir Galahad. Music of beauty and power is offered. The score for literary features for the three years becomes 28 (40); 36 (40); 16 (20). Total 80 (100). Result 80%.

The subject matter for Juniors. (Score Card, Sec. III). Content is almost wholly drawn from the Bible. The aims carefully wrought out

stey by step terminate upon life, but they cannot be said to make adequate connection with it. These units are of great value in matters of ideals, attitudes, motives, standards, loyalties, and ambitions for service; they are lowest in the matters of correlating with the active lives which the pupils daily live. There is little project, less dramatization. Age twelve pupils desire group organization. None is here suggested. The abounding vigor of the materials for age twelve here gone over in Mark's gospel would correlate well with the active Camp Fire and Scout programs. The pupils, as too often with their elders, are sent away with splendid ideals and resolves unlived. The detailed grading upon content values for individual life is as follows: The age nine unit 30 (50); 33 (50); 40 (50); 28 (50); 18 (50). Total 149 (250). Result 60%. For the age ten unit 40 (50); 35 (50); 45 (50); 38 (50); 30 (50). Total 188 (250). Result 75%. For the age twelve unit 30 (50); 30 (50); 36 (50); 30 (50); 28 (50). Total 154 (250). Result 61%.

Two years are given to a survey of the span of history prior to Christ. Is an underlying conception of progress laid? Are the pupils prepared for the purposes of conquest which they encounter in the ideals held by Christ in Mark's gospel? Are the parables of social permeation brought across to children who at twelve have begun to be conscious of larger human groupings? Civics, history and geography have come. Does religion arrive? The scoring upon social adaptations reaches these totals: For age nine materials, 15 (25); 10 (25); 16 (25); 6 (25); 5 (25). Total 52 (125). Result 41%. For age ten materials, 20 (25); 14 (25); 18 (25); 6 (25); 5 (25). Total 63 (125). Result 50%. For age twelve materials, 15 (25); 9 (25); 17 (25); 5 (25); 5 (25). Total 51 (125). Result 40%.

Preparation for the church and progressive incorporation into its program is an aim which appears implicitly, rather than by consistent effort, to attain these ends. The selection of hymns is superior and for the most part of suitable difficulty. Upon content, considering the demands of the church, the units score as follows: Age nine, 20 (25); 16 (25); 17 (25); 12 (25); 13 (25). Total 78 (125). Result 62%. Year ten, 20 (25); 17 (25); 16 (25); 12 (25); 12 (25). Total 76 (125). Result 60%. Year twelve, 25 (25); 13 (25); 20 (25); 10 (25); 10 (25). Total 78 (125). Result 62%.

Suitability for learning. (Score Card, Sec. IV). In provision of helpful features to motivate and assist learning there is too little variety, interest, challenge and difficulty in the home work asked for. Genuine problems might be more constantly introduced. Collateral references of various sorts should be much more frequent. There is too little variety of plan. The three units check alike 34 (40); 22 (40); 16 (40); 22 (40); 10 (40). Total 104 (200). Result 52%.

Teaching quality. (Score Card, Sec. V). Psychology demands unification and fixation by recall. A teachers' manual, especially in

a once-a-week course, should provide for frequent associations with previous experiences and subject matter. Should text books become note books? Should not pupils' results be incorporated in their problem books? Means of cooperation between teachers, pupils and parents ought to be presented. This is essential in moral and religious training, particularly so since so large a fraction of the learnings of such courses as these must be applied to life within the home, if they are ever to be applied at any place. The scores for the three units upon pedagogical organization in behalf of the teachers are, 35 (75); 52 (75). Total 87 (150). Result 58%.

The percentages are:

	Age 9.	Age 10.	Age 12.
Mechanical quality	64	64	50
Artistic quality	80	80	80
Content, individual	60	75	61
Content, social	41	50	40
Content, the church	62	60	62
Pedagogy, the pupil	52	52	52
Pedagogy, the teacher	58	58	58
Averages	59	62	57

6. *The Unit for Age Eleven, "New Testament Stories About Jesus and His Friends."*

The aim places the emphasis upon that part of the Junior aims which has for particular objective a response to the friendship of Jesus.

An attractive letter introduces the children to their year's note book project. The lesson material follows the analysis: "Diduknow?" "Canuwork?" and "Willuthink?" The first section gives the setting, facts and teaching, the second provides blanks to be filled daily from Bible references given, puzzles also being proposed. The third section proposes questions requiring some reflection. The Keystone definitely turns from the Old Testament International nominations and selects Christian concepts, ideals and activities thought to correlate more nearly with childhood and modern life. For teachers a section discusses "The Junior's Needs", and four memory hymns are inserted. Correlative lessons on the Bible and hymns are set up. A constant lesson plan is followed through the year. Quotations from standard authors are plentiful. A "meditation" is conducted weekly.

In mechanical execution this unit is of even quality with those for ages nine and ten. 9 (10); 8 (10); 8 (10); 2 (10); 5 (10). Total 32 (50). Result 64%.

As literature. (Score Card, Sec. II). In estimating literary value pupils' materials are found to be brief and didactic, lacking beauty, climax and dramatic interest. The expanded story of the lesson

adheres rather closely to Bible fact and its character application. This limitation does not make for literary freedom. The four hymns are not great in music. For literary beauty and fitness the unit is scored 15 (40); 25 (40); 5 (20). Total 45 (100). Result 45%.

The subject matter for age eleven. (Score Card, Sec. III). The aims in this unit appear to be Christ centered, but on examination are found to be child centered, the objective being to make Christ so real and attractive to the children as to attach them to him by strong personal bonds of admiration, affection, respect and dependence. An end within the child is sought. The aim is ethical and personal, but the point of lack, as elsewhere, is in a program with grip upon conduct whereby to express reverence, fair play, helpfulness and other responses. The individual values of content check 45 (50); 36 (50); 27 (50); 24 (50); 16 (50). Total 148 (250). Result 59%.

As a preparation for participation in society with wide understanding of the applications of religion to its problems or with intelligent ideals of social ethics or with skill in their application to life situations, this unit promises little. The unit presents to its vigorous boys of eleven years the call of Christ's friendliness but omits the call of the heroic in the Master. His strength, resistance, leadership, outlook, moral majesty and his courage, moral and physical, ought all to find a place this year. The score for social values becomes 12 (25); 14 (25); 13 (25); 8 (25); 5 (25). Total 52 (125). Result 41%.

One of the aims in year twelve is church membership. Much preparative training should be given in year eleven. A Junior church, of whatever form or name, might well be planned, this course to be definitely correlated therewith. The score upon training for religious organization is 20 (25); 6 (25); 8 (25); 10 (25); 8 (25). Total 52 (125). Result 41%.

Learning quality. (Score Card, Sec. IV). Organization in behalf of pupils secures unity to the loss of variety. Stress and neglect is a principle not observed. There is too constant moralizing, too little concrete action. There is little drill, little attempt to develop skills. There is too slight correlation with literature, art, history, geography. Yet in spite of this, historical reality has been achieved within the gospel story. The score on pedagogy in behalf of the learner is 20 (40); 10 (40); 12 (40); 5 (40); 7 (40). Total 53 (200). Result 27%.

Teachers' materials. (Score Card, Sec. V). In teachers' materials there are three points of weakness. There is little provision for reviews. There is lack of adequate provision for direction of the pupils by the teachers with reference to the work expected of the pupils at home. There is inadequate recognition planned whereby out-of-class written work will be reviewed, corrected, commended or credited. One excellence is notable. Enrichment material of a content sort is generously furnished, usually by quotation of important

passages from standard works, but also by the inclusion of excellent lists of books, both upon teaching principles and upon content. The scoring of teachers' materials is 30 (75); 40 (75). Total 70 (150). Result 46%.

Summary for the eleven-year-old unit:

Mechanical value	64
Literary value	45
Content, the individual	59
Content, society	41
Content, the church	41
Organization for the pupil	27
Organization for the teacher	46
Eleven year average	46

7. *Materials for Ages Thirteen and Fourteen, "Old Testament Leaders," "New Testament Leaders."*

These materials, prepared by a single author, are uniform in quality. Much is made of the pupils' note books. Work planned includes maps, notes, drawings, summaries, quotations, original composition, and a limited amount of decorative effort. The atmosphere changes on entering these units. The pupil is treated almost as an adult.

For teachers, extended and well organized discussion is given to The Intermediate Boy, The Intermediate Girl, The Thirteen Year Old Girl, Thirteen Year Old Pupils in School, Some Principles of Teaching, When a Lesson Is Well Taught, Securing Home Work, The Organized Class, and What to Read. Writers are Frank Otis Erb, Ph. D., W. Edward Raffety, Ph. D., Mary E. Moxcey, Margaret Slattery, W. T. Stevens, Eugene C. Foster. Each lesson is carefully planned. Definite teaching procedure is suggested. Note book work is given attention. The next lesson is considered and assignments suggested.

Pictures. (Score Card, Sec. I). In mechanical quality the pictures are much better executed than in the previous unit. The use of Underwood and Underwood pictures commends the courses. The rating is, 7 (10); 6 (10); 6 (10); 5 (10); 5 (10). Total 29 (50). Result 58%.

Literature. (Score Card, Sec. II). The literary style is marked by simplicity, directness and much of beauty. The literary quotations are uniformly well chosen and adapted to purpose. The pictures are chosen almost wholly for their historical interest rather than for any artistic reasons. No music whatever appears. The rating is 30 (40); 35 (40); 5 (20). Total 70 (100). Result 70%.

Questions of Content. (Score Card, Sec. III). In estimating content, the individual considered, one misses at once the presence of any worship materials. There is no memory material in the age thirteen unit, too much in the succeeding year. There is too little

consciousness of the vocational importance of these two years, especially of the fourteenth year, in a large proportion of American homes. The lessons are keyed culturally high—upon planes of intellectual interest and grasp rather beyond many of the constituency served. The materials are probably a year or two old, in their moral and intellectual problems. The content values, individual, score 40 (50); 45 (50); 29 (50); 27 (50); 33 (50). Total 174 (250). Result 69%.

The aims in these units appear to be psychological rather than socialized. On the side of activities the Scouting and Camp Fire programs are favorably referred to—and left at that. Here is an open door for religious education. It ought to be entered or, if not, a better one should be opened. The years twelve, thirteen and fourteen are the years when such socialized activities as are worked out in these programs should be a recognized part of the religious curriculum. Religious learning should be correlated with such activities upon a thoroughgoing plan. Content values, social, are 13 (25); 16 (25); 16 (25); 9 (25); 15 (25). Total 69 (125). Result 55%.

The two courses are not ecclesiastical in their aims, as they should be at this age, in the direction of responsibility, service and loyalty. Neither are there hymnology, hymns, orders of worship or prayers. Content values, ecclesiastical, are 10 (25); 5 (25); 15 (25); 18 (25); 17 (25). Total 65 (125). Result 52%.

The Pupil's Level. (Score Card, Sec. IV). The level of discussion is difficult as a pupil comes from previous materials calling for much less individual judgment. Study is not expanded beyond the text and related Bible sections. The note book might become a method of reaction and expression even much more useful than it is. There are no drills, no group worship, no dramatization or other forms of social cooperation. The scoring on helps toward learning becomes 30 (40); 33 (40); 27 (40); 20 (40); 33 (40). Total 143 (200). Result 71%.

As a teacher's implement, (Score Card, Sec. V), the manual takes good rank. There is wealth of reading material. The general perspective centers upon the pupils rather upon the course. The struggle between the material and the child is not quite a drawn battle. There is much idealism. The scoring upon pedagogical provisions to aid in teaching becomes 34 (75); 57 (75). Total 91 (150). Result 60%.

The percentages for the years thirteen and fourteen are:

Mechanics	58
Literary excellence	70
Content, individual	69
Content, social	55
Content, ecclesiastical	52
Organization, the pupil	71
Organization, the teacher	60
Average for Courses VIII and IX	62

8. *The Courses for Years Fifteen and Sixteen, "The Life of Christ" and "The Life of the Christian."*

For age fifteen the course hopes "to set before the pupil through a biographical study of Jesus Christ, the highest possible ideals of Christian living in aspects and forms to which the impulses of his own nature may be expected to respond." During year sixteen it is aimed "to strengthen and encourage those young people who have decided to live the Christian life and to help others to accept Jesus as their personal Saviour." Few alterations have been made from the International basic materials.

The use of Underwood and Underwood stereographs made from Palestine photographs is planned through the three-quarters of the year given to the incidents of Jesus' life. In the year given to the Christian life no maps and few pictures occur. Space is reserved for the plan of stating questions with blank lines for written answers. In the teachers' manuals the aims are discussed and the year's outline of lessons is given. The Teacher's Study Hour and The Teacher's Class Hour are presented. An article follows, "The Second Year High School Pupils," by Professor Howard G. Colwell, of Central High School, St. Louis. There are no appendices. A plan of "handling the material" and conducting the class is offered each week.

Mechanically, (Score Card, Sec. I), these units rank low. The large size page and the pamphlet form are thoroughly undesirable in the eyes of young people. The quarterlies are not attractive. Page organization lacks invitation. The form is too like that of a treatise. The pictures ought to be much better done. The following scores have been given on mechanical excellence: 8 (10); 3 (10); 7 (10); 3 (10). Total 27 (50). Result 54%.

Style and Pictures, (Score Card, Sec. II). In literary quality the narrative style is clear and simple. Sentences are well built and paragraph unity is observed. Elegance, skill of climax and dramatic effect are not present. Pictures are presented usually for historical realism farther than for art reasons. Hoffman, Eugene Buruand, Siemenroth, J. M. Swan, R. A. Tissot, Plockhorst, Edward Armitage, R. A., E. Goodwyn Lewes and William Hale have pictures. The score upon literary and artistic value is 24 (40); 28 (40); 12 (20). Total 64 (100). Result 64%.

Evaluation of Content. (Score Card, Sec. III). The two units, closely one in plan, have ideals and purposes which terminate upon personal life and upon ecclesiastical loyalty. The unit is accordingly poor in general social outlook and is over-individualized. Why should such an emphasis leave a vocational blank as has been done here? Is work an Edenic penalty or it is a Christian concept underlying civilization and the Kingdom of God? Should we not teach the Christian

implications involved in the modern necessity of industrial interdependence? The balance in the lessons seems to lie with the personal and introspective at a time when objectivity belongs on the program. "Are the pupils helped to habits of thinking through problems to self formed conclusions?" (Score Card, Question 25). There is too much of external authority perhaps and too little conscious training for auto-decision. Content, individual values, has scored 45 (50); 38 (50); 40 (50); 13 (50); 15 (50). Total 151 (250). Result 60%.

Social education, notably in attitudes and habits is rather a minus than a plus quantity here. Wholesome social relations are an interest at fifteen and sixteen. The religious curriculum has a stake. Civics furnishes food for thought in these years. This demands adequate consideration at the hands of the religious curriculum writer. Most of the Score Card questions on content, socially estimated, must receive markings near zero. The check has resulted 8 (25); 9 (25); 7 (25); 5 (25); 5 (25). Total 34 (125). Result 27%.

These courses aim to lead youth into the church. Why then so little instruction about the living, present, going church with its face to face challenge and problems? The New Testament church need not be left out. But the laboratory is at hand—the present church—ready for supervised observation, report and even criticism. Loyalty and pride come from participation, but here the plans of these courses too nearly break down. Instruction must have application. The scores upon content values for the church are 25 (25); 13 (25); 22 (25); 9 (25); 12 (25). Total 81 (125). Result 64%.

As Pupils' Materials, (Score Card, Sec. IV), the lessons are not rich except in their wealth of Bible material. Allusions to the great in art, literature, history and science are usually lacking. There is no wealth of suggestions for supplementary reading, investigation or writing beyond the pupil's own growing Life of Christ, which is a project of greatest value, running through a year. The gospel harmony, also recommended as a project, is much too difficult. The unit is weak in variety, in helpful assignment and supervision and in suggestions for discussion and individual or group activity. The score upon pupil's pedagogy is 20 (40); 13 (40); 10 (40); 12 (40); 5 (40). Total 60 (200). Result 30%.

Teacher's Pedagogy. (Score Card, Sec. V). The general discussion of middle adolescence, for teachers, is very inadequate. There should be suitable general consideration of the objectives of church membership and this in relation to the larger social objectives of religion. There are no reading suggestions for pupils, and in the year fifteen unit no bibliography for teachers, while the content book list in the next unit is very inadequate. The teachers' manuals are themselves strong in their content value. Biblical learning is evident. The lack is in pedagogical organization. The score upon teacher's pedagogy is

15 (75); 30 (75). Total 45 (150). Result 30%.

The percentages for the years fifteen and sixteen are:

Mechanical quality	54
Literary quality	64
Content, individual	60
Content, social	27
Content, the church	64
Pedagogy, the pupil	30
Pedagogy, the teacher	30
Average	47

9. *Course XII, "The World a Field for Christian Service."*

This course is designed as the first of several courses for seventeen year old classes or older, and is not closely correlated with age interests. The published aims are "to lead the pupil to see life in proper perspective from the Christian point of view, and to aid him in finding his place and part in the world's work; to lead the pupil through frank conferences on himself, his limitations, and his relations to the Kingdom of God, to a realization of the claims of Christ as Saviour and Lord, and of his service as the true basis of successful living." Accordingly the lessons include such titles as the needs of the world, the ultimate aim of Christian service, success, physical, mental and spiritual efficiency, service through home making and parenthood. The vocations are successively considered. A group of lessons deals with the ethical foundations of usefulness and social relations. Twelve lessons on the "typical" books of Ruth and James conclude the year. The concepts handled do not derive from a Bible program of lessons. Discussional opportunity is encouraged.

The teachers' general topics are: the age of seventeen; the aim of the course; nature of the course; general suggestions for the teacher. At each lesson Supplementary reading is outlined both on content and pedagogy. Questions proposed in the students' text are considered at length and a detailed class program is suggested.

Type Work. (Score Card, Sec. I). In mechanics the estimate is low. The type work is fair, on poor paper. The page is not built to meet present standards in the book maker's art. There are no pictures. Score, mechanical excellence, 8 (10); 3 (10); 5 (10); 0 (0); 3 (10). Total 19 (40). Result 47%.

Literary quality of the writing (Score Card, Sec. II) is high, though the style may be felt to belong rather to the final years of later adolescence. There is climax, suspended interest, some use of the dramatic. Pictures and music, being absent, must be left out of the score, which becomes 33 (40); 22 (40); 0 (0). Total 55 (80). Result 68%.

The Material for Seventeen Year Old Students. (Score Card, Sec. III). Content, individually considered, is objective, certainly not introspective. The Christian's program is presented large mindedly. Narrowness of religious view could not result from this course. The major aim carried forward is the religious motivation of the choice and pursuit of a life work selected and prepared for in view of the world's needs. The question is whether all this is not too late in the experience of many. Greater place should be given to religious education both as vocation and as avocation. Revision when carried out should expand the sections on the use of leisure time and recreational life. These may be designated as principal weaknesses of the course. The score, content, individual, is 50 (50); 45 (50); 48 (50); 29 (50); 32 (50). Total 204 (250). Result 80%.

In this course the world is a social unit, and in slow upward movement, the Kingdom of God the religious name for this movement. Yet there is little internationalism or inter-racial fraternity. Business and industry are too little touched upon as a field for Christianity. Stewardship should bulk larger. There is call to the gifted and favored to accept life as an opportunity of social service. The causes and meaning of poverty should be better considered. Large areas of sensitivity are touched, but the finding of avenues of response is left almost wholly to individual initiative and chance. The score, content, social values: 25 (25); 16 (25); 15 (25); 5 (25); 14 (25). Total 75 (125). Result 60%.

The course is not an ecclesiastical one. It is without church instruction, or reference to worship as a common activity. More should be made of inter-church comity, co-operation and unity in a course having general social objectives. There exists within the program of the course more opportunity than has been seized to teach tolerance and breadth of spirit. The missionary function of the church has been presented in the broad. Score 20 (25); 7 (25); 18 (25); 13 (25); 15 (25). Total 73 (125). Result 58%.

The Learning Organization. (Score Card, Sec. IV). The chief excellence in the learning organization is in the keen appreciation of the present point of contact. The problems are suited to age, are challenging and possess direct interest. A disappointing poverty of reading references exists where senior high school pupils have favorable opportunities. The score on pedagogical arrangement in behalf of the student: 26 (40); 27 (40); 24 (40); 20 (40); 8 (40). Total 105 (200). Result 52%.

Teaching Organization. (Score Card, Sec. V). As a teaching unit the course succeeds not by organization but by inherent value of content. Review, assignment and supplementary material are all neglected. Psychological and sociological backgrounds are not presented

as they should now be. The last decade has witnessed many changes, the war has intervened, the eighteenth and nineteenth amendments have been written, science and education have advanced, and religious thought itself is changing in search of advanced footing. A course which addresses itself to the Christian orientation of young people of this generation must take account, in its pedagogical arrangement, of all these things. Score, teaching facility, 18 (75); 34 (75). Total 52 (150). Result 34%.

For the seventeen year course:

Mechanics	47
Literary features	68
Content, individual	80
Content, society	60
Content, the church	58
Learning organization	52
Teaching organization	34
Average	57.

SUMMARY OF PERCENTAGES REACHED BY EACH UNIT UNDER EACH PRINCIPAL CATEGORY OF THE SCORE CARD

	The Little Child and the Heavenly Father	Stories About God's Gifts	Stories About God's Helpers	Stories About God's Will	Stories of the Long Ago	Old Testament Stories	New Testament Stories	The Great Leader	Old Testament Leaders	New Testament Leaders	The Life of Christ	The Life of the Christian	The World a Field for Christian Service	Mean
Course (Grade)		I	II	III	IV	V	VI	VII	VIII	IX	X	XI	XII	
Year of Age	4, 5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	....
Mechanical Quality	50	42	42	54	64	64	64	50	58	58	54	54	47	53
Literary Excellence ..	75	60	60	60	80	80	45	80	70	70	64	64	68	67
Content, the Child....	80	57	84	60	60	75	59	61	69	69	60	60	80	67
Content, Society	73	52	62	36	41	50	41	40	55	55	27	27	60	47
Content, the Church	68	68	70	57	62	60	41	62	52	52	64	64	58	59
Aids for the Pupil....	75	55	72	31	52	52	27	52	71	71	30	30	52	51
Aids for the Teacher	73	55	67	28	58	58	46	58	60	60	30	30	34	50
Mean	70	55	65	46	59	62	46	57	62	62	47	47	57	56

CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The advance which was made toward adequate religious education when the International Graded Lessons were issued constituted a long stage beyond the uniform system of Sunday school lessons wherein the same biblical material was presented to adults and children of all ages alike. But it was only a stage. Revision and improvement must follow. The future International Graded Lessons should be based upon new International Graded Objectives. These should be determined by persons competent to take all the factors into account. It is an undertaking calling for experts in religion, experts in education, experts in social science, all of these to be persons of eminent judgment and possessing common knowledge of the elements of religion, education and social science. The undertaking should be carried through by a sufficient number of workers to insure results unimpaired by narrowness of outlook, scientific or religious. To meet these objectives a system of lessons should then be proposed sufficiently universal in value, rich in content and flexible in adaptation to meet the needs of a constituency as various as the many sided people of America. It should be accurate in its adaptation to the needs of children. It should be calculated to fulfill the religious-social demands of the time. It should take into account every feature of the entire program of religious education, Sunday, week-day, vacation, adult, college; instruction, motivation and activity. This double instrument—objectives and lessons—should not be regarded as a fixed means of procedure. The religious curriculum ought always to be adapting itself to progress. It is this advancing and improving lesson base which, it is assumed, should be the base of the future Keystone series as long as there is a place for denominationally organized texts.

The following recommendations have already been suggested in whole or part and have to do with all the units of the Keystone as they may be revised or rewritten. They are suggested as attempts toward the fulfillment of the principles of religious education accepted as the basis of this study. Specific recommendations have occurred in the detailed consideration of the various units as the scoring has been discussed.

1. Home Correlation.

All units, particularly the pre-adolescent ones, suffer an immeasurable loss from the failure to attempt collusion, understanding, and a practical program of application, with the home itself. The home is society's first church. It is a commonplace of Sunday school experi-

ence that the children who are "sent" rather than "brought" to the church school cannot be expected to make the advancement made by those whose parents are deeply and closely interested in what is done there. If the curriculum of this school does not take the parents into the account, provide a plan of common effort in which the teachers and parents, linked by the children themselves, shall be parties to a joint enterprise, to what program may we look for unity of educational effort? If there is no unity of educational effort with the child as its center how can we advance far beyond past gains? We expect future revisions of curriculum materials to give adequate thought, experiment and re-experiment to this matter. Especially in the first years the mother is the key to the religious situation. The teacher can be an inspirer, friend and guide if she is also a good learner. But the curriculum materials should be source book for both. These materials ought to be more than merely adequate. A system of collusion with the home, into which the children should be drawn, ought to be carefully prepared, involving not only reports, letters to parents, parents' materials upon the lessons and their objectives, but also some means of encouraging and receiving suggestions from parents, to be utilized in teaching. All this should be done for the series as a whole and should be followed in each yearly unit.

2. Worship Materials.

Worship should be planned as a feature of the series throughout as it is a group activity expected throughout life. Each unit, as revised or rewritten, should advance step by step in the program of worship as planned for the entire series of years. The program of home co-operation should be considered in this connection. In a few homes family worship may be expected to occur, but the materials may be prepared on the assumption that home worship will have to come, as a rule, from suggestions made through the school curriculum. Worship in the school should receive careful consideration and the curriculum should provide instruction and worship materials suited to the entire range of schools served, from those illy organized to highly departmentalized schools. The preparation of such a program is as extensive a problem as the production of any one of the genera. yearly units already prepared. It should probably be attempted by collaboration, persons working together who are equipped by training, by knowledge of the successive age requirements, by appreciation of historic worship, by understanding of the aesthetic element in worship, and by their mature Christian feeling and rich Christian experience. A contribution of great value may here be made to religious education.

3. Missionary Education.

A great deal of attention has been given in the Keystone Series to the incorporation of missionary stories and lessons into the courses.

The Baptist churches, the primary public for these courses, have been missionary in their genius and spirit. This fact should be studied. The present understanding held as to the meaning, motives and objectives of the missionary enterprise in the world should be studied. The pedagogical necessities and values involved should be studied. Existing materials should be assembled. From a survey of all the facts it should be possible to place in the hands of those who rewrite the Keystone those materials of instruction which will furnish the children served with a unified understanding of the missionary enterprise having the authority of inclusive fact. At no point in religious education, as now attempted, is there such chaos as here. If the International and Keystone can furnish the children with the best available materials in this part of their religious training, by this method, it will serve a genuine educational end.

4. Correlation with Public School Subjects.

A major consideration in any revision of the religious curriculum lies in the fact that just as a child is a unit the curriculum which he follows is a unit also. We may not mean it to be. We may even do all we blunderingly can to disunify it. But to him it hangs, beautifully or otherwise, together. The child is the unit of correlation. This makes necessary the consideration, by the builder of a religious curriculum, of all the objectives and subjects of that part of the child's formal curriculum which he finds in the public schools. It is at once apparent that this will mean a careful consideration, in particular, of all the child's social studies. If the progression in the public school is to pass from nature study in grades I-IV into local history in V, local geography in VI, world geography in VII, vocational civics in VIII, and thence to community civics in IX, world history in X, and economics, or sociology or social problems or problems of democracy or American history in XI and XII, what is all this to religion? Whatever the progression is there, it is of interest to us here. If religion is a form of life, a spirit whose interest is universal, then nothing human is alien to itself. If the sanctions of religion are needed in social reform, if men need to know what religion has to do with the slum and the World Court, the wage scale and eugenics then it is wise to begin to relate religion to nature study and geography and history from their beginnings. A great deal more attention must be given than in the past to questions of curriculum correlation. The child should not be permitted to feel that in passing from the Church school to the week-day school he is now going to another and different world; nor that his religion deals with one realm, his general education with another; nor that his religion has not a place and interest in every feature of his learnings and his life. It should be recommended that the writers of religious curriculum materials know intimately the non-religious materials used by the children for whom they write and

that adequate interpretations and cross references be made to affect a unified correlation in the children's minds.

5. Correlation with Play Life.

In revision there should be correlation with play life. Play is an unwritten chapter in the materials of religious education. Not only should religion be related to and built into play, but play should contribute its own large part toward the religious learnings, attitudes and habits of the children's lives. This should be true from kindergarten to maturity. Dramatization itself, the gift of religion to the modern world, has been debased, but may become an agency of training second to none. Point of contact, interest, expression, idealism all are here. In revision, dramatization should be largely used in every unit. The entire recreational life of children and youth should be regarded a part of the curriculum of religious education and constant use of it be made as illustration and as field of application for the principles and ideals learned in religion.

6. Problem Books.

It is recommended that the plan of providing blank spaces in the text books themselves for replies to questions and topics therein presented be abandoned and in its place problem books be provided in which the questions, topics, problems, or projects be definitely presented and replies and solutions entered. This would make for better use and preservation of texts but, more important, would make for better assignment, better follow up, and a more nearly worthy use of the problem method in the teaching.

7. Binding.

It is recommended that a binding equal to that of the better books which visit the shelves of home replace the pamphlet form in the case of all the units. Money here will be more than returned. A campaign of education would commend the plan to the purses of the public served. Our religious curriculum deserves to be redeemed from the hazard, indignity and disadvantage which all paper bound printed matter incurs. Our children deserve to have their religious materials come to them most attractively dressed of all the materials which they receive.

8. Illustrations and Decoration.

It is recommended that a standard uniformly high be adhered to with reference to illustrations, and that the interior beauty of the units be made such as to attract and win their users.

SUMMARY

In summary then it may be said that the Keystone series affords

a notable advance upon all previous materials in general use among the church schools intended to be served.

It is judged to fail at the points and in the proportions indicated by the scores arrived at and in the summary percentages indicated, of which a conspectus is given at page 35.

The summary questions are those with which the study started. In how far does this series of texts provide materials suited to carry the sanctions and inspirations of religion over into the conduct and character of children and so provide an instrument of social control calculated to introduce intelligent righteousness into society? It half succeeds and half fails. If imperfection is failure it has failed. If partial success is genuine success it has succeeded in part. The lack under the categories of knowledge and attitude is always less than under the category of action. The point of most significant weakness lies in the lack of provision for sufficient concrete execution of truths and ideals in life situations, personal and social. Learnings begin too uniformly in the Bible, too little in the child's life. They end too usually in instruction or ideal, too seldom in action fitted to express these.

Revised in pursuance of adequate, graded and inclusive objectives, the series may come to express the best religious conceptions of the churches which use and limit it and may come to approximate the best educational practice.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Gilbert, Simeon, *The Lesson System*, Phillips and Hunt, 1879, for a history of origin and inauguration of International lessons.

Sampey, John Richard, *The International Lesson System*, Revell, 1911, for an account of the origin and development of the International lessons.

Official Report Eleventh International Sunday School Convention, Toronto, 1905, for historical material on Sunday Schools, 1780-1905.

Rice, Edwin Wilbur, *The Sunday School Movement*, Philadelphia, 1917.

Haslett, Samuel B., *The Pedagogical Bible School*, Revell, 1903.

Meyer, Henry H., *Lessons and Requisites for The Graded Sunday School Lessons*, New York, 1915.

Trumbull, Henry Clay, *Yale Lectures on the Sunday School*, its origin, mission, auxiliaries and methods, Philadelphia, 1888.

Edworthy, Z. B., *An Evaluation of Memory Materials* for ages 4-11 in the International Graded Lessons and the Christian Nurture Series, Master's Thesis, Northwestern University, 1923. For criteria of Evaluation pp. 28-30 and for evaluations *ad. loc.*

Danielson, Frances Weld, *Lessons for Teachers of Beginners*, The Pilgrim Press, 1914. Writer of Keystone Beginners' Course.

Lamoreaux, Antoinette Abernathy, *The Unfolding Life*, F. H. Revell Co., 1907. Writer of Course I.

Evans, Herbert Francis, *The Sunday School Building and Its Equipment*, University of Chicago Press, 1914. Writer of Courses X and XI.

For comparison, the following principal series of texts now used in the Sunday School field may be referred to:

The Christian Nurture Series (Protestant Episcopal), Morehouse Publishing Co., Milwaukee.

The Beacon Course, The Beacon Press, Boston, Mass.

The Westminster Text Books of Religious Education, Presbyterian Board of Publication and Sabbath School Work.

The Berean Graded Lessons (Methodist Episcopal), Methodist Book Concern.

For comparison with series intended for use in Sunday Schools and other schools and classes, the following may be examined:

The Constructive Studies in Religion, University of Chicago Press.

The Completely Graded Series, Scribners.

The Abingdon Weekday Religious Education Texts, Abingdon.

The Abingdon Vacation Church School Texts, Abingdon.

Charters, Werrett Wallace, *Curriculum Construction*, MacMillan, 1923. For insistence upon the purity of activities (duties) with ideals and the primacy of use over system and formal discipline in determining curriculum values.

Bobbitt, Franklin, *The Curriculum*, Houghton Mifflin, 1918. Religious education a widening of the social sympathies and outlook. Virtues not our direct aim. The religious sympathies to be widened so that one achieves the "large-group consciousness, valuations and sympathies" and conceives "one's membership in an order that includes all things that are and all benevolent non-earthly beings that are." Our aim to be the development of enlightened large-group consciousness in lieu of the primitive, competitive or naturalistic. What social science calls interdependence, co-operation, community of origin and group consciousness, religion calls the brotherhood of man.

Bobbitt, Franklin, *How to Make a Curriculum,* Houghton Miffln, 1924. Objectives of education arrived at by "activity-analysis": social intercommunication, maintenance of physical efficiency, efficient citizenship, general social contacts and relationships, leisure occupations, general mental efficiency, religious attitudes and activities, parental responsibilities, unspecialized practical activities, occupational activities.

Bonser, Frederick Gordon, *The Elementary School Curriculum,* MacMillan, 1920. For specification of job analysis as means of determining curriculum.

Moore, Ernest C., Editor *Minimum Course of Study,* Reports of Committees on Minimum Essentials in Elementary Education, MacMillan, 1922. A study of (a) aims and (b) essentials in the subjects in the elementary course made by seventeen committees of teachers and superintendents in Southern California. 402 pp. with bibliographies.

Bagley, William C., *Educational Values,* MacMillan, 1922. For analysis of hereditary and acquired conduct controls; classification of the functions of educative materials as training, instructional, inspirational, disciplinary, recreative or interpretative.

McMurry, Frank Morton, *Principles Underlying Making of Curricula,* Teacher's College Record, Vol. 16, No. 4, pp. 1-32, 1915.

McMurry, Charles Alexander, *Course of Study in the Eight Grades,* MacMillan, 1906.

Betts, George Herbert, *Social Principles of Education,* Scribners, 1912.

Cubberley, Ellwood Patterson, *Changing Conceptions in Education,* Houghton Mifflin, 1909. *Public Education in the United States,* Houghton Mifflin, 1919.

Graves, Frank Pierrepont, *A History of Education in Modern Times,* MacMillan, 1913.

Clement, John Addison, *Curriculum Making in Secondary Schools,* Henry Holt & Co., 1923.

Dewey, John, *Child and Curriculum,* University of Chicago Press, 1908, 1922.

Dewey, John, *Democracy and Education,* MacMillan, 1916, 1920. *Human Nature and Conduct,* Holt and Company, 1922.

Wilson, H. B. and G. M., *The Motivation of School Work,* Houghton Mifflin, 1916.

Meriam, Junius L., *Child Life and the Curriculum,* World Book Company, Yonkers-on-Hudson, 1920.

Norsworthy and Whitley, *Psychology of Childhood,* MacMillan, 1922. Habit and Learning, Ch. XI; Play, Ch. XII; Moral and Religious Development, Ch. XIII.

Starch, Daniel, *Educational Psychology,* MacMillan, 1922.

Starbuck, Edwin D., Chairman, The Iowa Plan, *Character Education Methods,* Character Education Institution, Washington, D. C.

Stevenson, John Alford, *The Project Method,* MacMillan, 1921. Ch. V for motivation, interest and thinking, furthered by project problems.

McMurry, Charles Alexander, *Teaching by Projects,* MacMillan. For fundamental treatment of the project problem method.

Youtz, Herbert Alden, *The Insolvency of the Self,* article in Christian Century, pp. 170-173, Feb. 7, 1924. Upon the essential place of a *self* in educational psychology, stating "the issue between a materialistic theory of life and a spiritualistic theory" and defending the necessity of spiritual initiative as the hope of society.

Lee, Joseph, *Play in Education,* MacMillan, 1917.

Johnson, George Ellsworth, *Education by Plays and Games,* Ginn & Co., 1917. *Education Through Recreation,* Survey Committee of the Cleveland Foundation, 1916.

Tyler, John Mason, *Growth and Education,* Houghton Mifflin, 1907.

Sies, Alice Corbin, *Supervised Play in Childhood,* MacMillan, 1922. Valuable for suggestions especially for use of dramatic plays in childhood.

Curtis, Henry S., *The Play Movement and Its Significance,* MacMillan, 1917.

Rainwater, Clarence Elmer, *Play Movement in the United States,* University of Chicago Press, 1922. Ch. 6 states the entire argument of the book.

Richardson, Norman E., *The Church at Play,* Abingdon Press, 1922.

Coe, George Albert, *A Social Theory of Religious Education,* Scribners, 1917. "The changing social situations incident to the pupil's growth, with their inevitable problems of social adjustment, furnish a basis for the order and the use of the material. Chap. IX, A New Theory of the Curriculum.

Betts, George Herbert, *Social Principles of Education,* Scribners, 1912. *The Curriculum of Religious Education,* Abingdon, 1924. *How to Teach Religion,* Abingdon, 1919. Ch. VII, on subject matter.

Indiana Survey of Religious Education, Doran, 1924, Vol. II. For comparison of score card for evaluation of materials of religious education.

Ellwood, Charles A., *Christianity and Social Science.,* MacMillon, 1923, pp. 162-188 on the problem of religious education. *Carrying Education Through,* Religious Education, 1922, pp. 425-429.

Lawrence, Wm. Irwin, *The Social Emphasis in Religious Education,* The Beacon Press, 1918, pp. 57-99. For a valuable statement, sensing the results of educational psychology and suggesting the materials indicated for a scientific curriculum of religious education from the social and functional points of view.

Brown, Arlo Ayres, *A History of Religious Education in Recent Times,* Abingdon, 1923.

Coe, George Albert, *Opposing Theories of the Curriculum,* Religious Education, April, 1922.

Shaver, Erwin L., *Teaching Adolescents in the Church School,* Doran, 1923. "a plan book for training leaders of youth based on the project principle."

Chassell, Clara F., *Some New Tests in Religious Education,* Religious Education, 1921, pp. 319-336.

Chassell, Clara F. and Laura M., *A Test of Religious Ideas Involving the Ranking of Selected Answers,* Religious Education, 1922, pp. 55-59.

Hartshorne, Hugh, *Measurement of Growth in Religious Education,* Religious Education, June, 1919. *Childhood and Character,* Abingdon Press, 1919, pp. 172-176, for the objectives and attitudes of worship, the attitudes noted being gratitude, good-will, reverence, faith and loyalty. *Manual for Training and Worship,* Scribners, 1915.

Beard, Frederica, *Pictures in Religious Education,* Doran, 1920.

Hartshorne, Hugh, *A Bibliography on the Religious Life of Children in Religious Education,* 1921, p. 337.

Brightman, Edgar S., *The Personal Relation Between God and Children,* Religious Education, 1921, pp. 23-28.

Hodge, Richard Morse, *Instruction in Religion,* Religious Education, 1907, pp. 167-188, for outlines of the curriculum materials used in a number of church and experimental schools at this date.

Springston, J. D., *The Application of Modern Educational Theory to the Work of the Sunday School,* Religious Education, 1898, pp. 86-91.

Stewart, George B., *The Sunday School as an Educational Force in Social Duty*, Religious Education, 1909, pp. 253-256.

Harrison, Elizabeth, *The Religious Training of Children*, Religious Education, 1909, pp. 256-260.

Dalton, Samuel T., *Extra Biblical Material in History and Sociology*, Religious Education, 1909, pp. 434-437.

Symposium on *The Curriculum of the Sunday School*, Religious Education, 1909, pp. 281-431.

Symposium on *The Sunday School Curriculum*, Religious Education, 1910, pp. 244-272, for topics bearing on the story, music, art, adolescence, the selection of biblical material.

Bower, W. C., *A Suggestive Approach to the Reconstruction of the Curriculum of the School of Religion*, Religious Education, 1917, pp. 231-238.

Hunter, Marie Cole, *The International Note in the Church School Curriculum*, Religious Education, 1918, pp. 107-118.